



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 30, 2004

Ms. Sandra Smith  
Executive Director  
Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners  
333 Guadalupe, Suite 3-825  
Austin, Texas 78701-3942

OR2004-6419

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 206251.

The Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners (the "board") received a request for the board's file pertaining to a named chiropractor, with the exception of the chiropractor's social security number. The board has released some of the requested information but asserts the remainder is excepted from public disclosure under sections 552.026, 552.101, 552.114, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and have reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA") provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). The board is not an educational agency or institution.

However, FERPA provides that an educational agency or institution may only transfer personal information to a third party "on the condition that such party will not permit any

other party to have access to such information without the written consent of the parents of the student.” *Id.* § 1232g(b)(4)(B). The federal regulations provide that a third party that receives such information from an educational agency may use the information only for the purposes for which the disclosure was made. 34 C.F.R. § 99.33(a)(2). The board states it received the transcripts directly from the educational institutions. Thus, pursuant to sections 1232g(b)(4)(B) and 99.33(a)(2), the board may only release these transcripts upon consent of the chiropractor.<sup>1</sup>

Additionally, while the requestor in this instance asked specifically for “...the Board’s file(s) on [a named chiropractor]... with the exclusion of his social security number,” we note that some of the submitted documents contain the social security numbers of other individuals holding an ownership interest in the chiropractor’s practice. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also incorporates section 58.001 of the Occupations Code. This section provides as follows:

The social security number of an applicant for or holder of a license, certificate of registration, or other legal authorization issued by a licensing agency to practice in a specific occupation or profession that is provided to the licensing agency is confidential and not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code.

Occ. Code § 58.001.<sup>2</sup> Therefore, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.001 of the Occupations Code, the board must withhold from disclosure the social security numbers we have marked.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683.

In prior decisions, we have determined that financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first element of the common-law privacy test, but the public

---

<sup>1</sup> As our determinations under FERPA are dispositive, we need not address section 552.114.

<sup>2</sup> We note that the Seventy-eighth Legislature renumbered former section 56.001 of the Occupations Code as section 58.001. See Act of June 21, 2003, 78th Leg., R.S., ch. 1275, § 2(112), 2003 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4146.

has a legitimate interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 at 4 (1990) (“In general, we have found the kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common-law privacy to be those regarding the receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities”), 523 at 4 (1989) (noting distinction under common-law privacy between confidential background financial information furnished to public body about individual and basic facts regarding particular financial transaction between individual and public body), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public’s interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis).

You argue that certain financial information in Exhibit D is excepted by common-law privacy. Upon review of Exhibit D, we find that a portion of the information you seek to withhold is protected by common-law privacy. We have marked this information. The remaining financial information we find in Exhibit D involves a financial transaction with a governmental body. Thus, we conclude that none of the remaining information in Exhibit D may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You also raise section 552.130 of the Government Code. This section excepts from public disclosure information that relates to “a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, you must withhold the Texas driver’s license numbers you have marked under section 552.130.

Next, the board asserts that certain numbers it has marked are excepted from disclosure under section 552.136. Section 552.136 of the Government Code states that “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136. An access device number is one that may be used to “(1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* The board has not explained what these particular numbers are or how they can be used to obtain a thing of value or initiate a transfer of funds. Because the board has not shown the applicability of section 552.136, the board must release these number.

Lastly, we address your claim under section 552.137. As amended by the 78<sup>th</sup> Legislature, this section provides as follows:

- (a) Except as otherwise provided by this section, an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.

(b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

(c) Subsection (a) does not apply to an e-mail address:

(1) provided to a governmental body by a person who has a contractual relationship with the governmental body or by the contractor's agent;

(2) provided to a governmental body by a vendor who seeks to contract with the governmental body or by the vendor's agent;

(3) contained in a response to a request for bids or proposals, contained in a response to similar invitations soliciting offers or information relating to a potential contract, or provided to a governmental body in the course of negotiating the terms of a contract or potential contract; or

(4) provided to a governmental body on a letterhead, coversheet, printed document, or other document made available to the public.

(d) Subsection (a) does not prevent a governmental body from disclosing an e-mail address for any reason to another governmental body or to a federal agency.

Gov't Code § 552.137. Section 552.137(a) is applicable to certain e-mail addresses of members of the public that are provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body, unless the individual to whom the e-mail address belongs has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. Section 552.137(a) is not applicable to the types of e-mail addresses listed in section 552.137(c) or to an institutional e-mail address, an Internet website address, or an e-mail address that a governmental entity maintains for one of its officials or employees. Therefore, the board must withhold as confidential under section 552.137 the marked e-mail addresses found in the submitted documentation, unless the owner of a particular e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure.

In summary, the board may release transcripts received directly from educational institutions only upon consent of the chiropractor to whom the transcripts pertain, as provided by section 1232g(b)(4)(B) of title 20 of the United States Code and section 99.33(a)(2) of title 34 of the Code of Federal Regulations. The board must withhold the social security numbers we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.001 of the Occupations Code. The board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The board must withhold Texas

driver's license numbers under section 552.130. The board must withhold the e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137, unless the owner of the e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. The board must release the remaining submitted information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Michael A. Pearle". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Michael" being more prominent.

Michael A. Pearle  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MAP/jh

Ref: ID# 206251  
Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Susan Rogers  
Preston & Cowan, LLP  
909 East Fannin Street, Suite 1400  
Houston, Texas 77010-1006  
(w/o enclosures)